

3 Appendix

4

5 **Table 1: The significance of animal welfare education for children and young people (example responses to Round 1**
 6 **question concerning why AWE is important)**

Theme	Quotation	Anonymised ID
Focus on benefits for animals/animal welfare	It is the most important thing that we can do in society today - this is why our charity set up and it is something I feel has been swept under the carpet for far too long as it is a subject that people are worried about bringing up or discussing. Changing how we treat animals starts with our children	22
	It's extremely important if they can learn from a young age to care for and respect animals. It's also easier if they understand this whilst growing up as that way it becomes their social norm and so they hopefully know it's just the right thing to do	7
	Teaching children animal welfare is extremely important if we wish the next generation to treat animals in their homes and communities with kindness, compassion and to provide animals in their care with the five welfare needs	20
Developing compassion/ empathy	I think it's an essential part of learning to be a 'compassionate, responsible citizen'	15
	Very. I feel if they can show compassion and empathy to animals, they will be able to show more compassion in general. It also teaches respect and understanding for other living, sentient beings and consideration of their needs	6
	It would contribute to the development of vital life skills, including empathy and compassion for other sentient beings, which naturally extends to how they should interact with members of their own species!	4
Interrelationships between people, animals & environment	There is an increasing awareness that animal welfare, public health human wellbeing and the environment are intrinsically linked, so all children should be taught empathy and compassion through animal welfare as part of their education	2
	Working in China, we find that animal welfare is largely an unknown concept and the term 'animal welfare' has no comparative translation, therefore it is either misinterpreted or viewed as a 'luxury' of western cultures. Teaching animal welfare in China (as in many other Asian countries) it is best approached from a holistic angle i.e. the well-being of human, animals and the environment	9
	Teaching animal welfare gives children an understanding of how to care for and respect animals, improving their knowledge of the species that share our world and giving them greater concern for the environmental crisis that we all are facing.	4
Focus on skills	Skills in meeting and greeting (and subsequently interacting with) an animal properly, by using consent or willingness testing, allowing animal to approach, no tugging on ropes or leashes, no force-oriented equipment, etc.	8
	In my direct clinical work with children (and adults) where animals are involved, I always teach about body language, appropriate handling, etc. It does not take long to do so, and it is exceedingly important in my opinion. I believe that animal welfare education is important to remove the unintentional cruelty that may occur with young children but in many cases the root cause is not a lack of understanding but a redirecting of their own feelings / experiences and this also needs to be treated	23

7

8

9

10 **Table 2: The significance of cruelty prevention for children and young people (example responses to Round 1**
 11 **question concerning why it is important to intervene to prevent cruelty)**

Theme	Quotation	Anonymised ID
Focus on preventing escalation of cruelty and understanding the individual	This is essential. Such behaviour can escalate and can lead to an abusive adult and criminality if not addressed	12
	Cruelty can occur in many contexts and for many reasons, and the intervention must be tailored to the individual context in order for it to be effective and prevent future incidents. It may simply be a question of ignorance and 'myth busting' or it may be a much more in depth approach to addressing the situation of the individual, and how the incident arose. Intervention is put in place only when an incident has occurred, or the risk of an incident has been detected. In these cases, intervention should really include (but not be limited to) the re-education of the young person, and the re-connection of them with compassion for other sentient beings. In our experience, empathy is not necessarily absent from a young person who has been involved in an animal cruelty incident. Their own empathy can be used to enable them to understand the consequences of their actions, and to appreciate what the animal experienced as a result	2
	Vitally important, without intervention and understanding how will it stop	19
Prevention/early intervention should be the priority	Prevention is always better than cure, to create interventions to teach children the consequences of their actions to animals and others will help in the long term. This is vital	24
	Prevention should be our priority - the focus and available resources are still too heavily weighted toward the alleviation of suffering and the prosecution of cruelty	1
	Very important. The [AW organisation] launched its First Strike Campaign back in 1997 which focused on the parallels between child abuse and animal abuse. This subsequently involved a Pilot Project ... that had a core aim to promote improved reporting of animal welfare cases, to the right people. Since this campaign was launched the Links Group continued its work in particular focusing on vets recognition of non-accidental injuries in animals as a first indicator that something may be wrong in a household and may need further investigation. A lot of work both in the US and in the UK is going on when it comes to the links between animal cruelty and human violence Many of the cases we see could be prevented if intervention had occurred at an early stage both through preventative education programmes in schools but also an awareness of positive animal welfare amongst the general public	25
Focus on knowledge/ challenging myths	Extremely important, even if it's just being able to challenge those myths such as 'cats have 9 lives'. I feel a large part of animal cruelty takes place due to lack of understanding of their needs	4
	The intervention must be tailored to the individual context in order for it to be effective and prevent future incidents. It may simply be a question of ignorance and 'myth busting'	2
	I think the intervention is hugely important. If we can address any misconceptions and make children aware that animals are sentient beings from an early age then the number of animal cruelty cases should decrease over time	14
Important to end suffering	If unnecessary suffering is being caused to any sentient being then it is of course important to intervene to address that immediate need. Let's be clear though, such an intervention is for the benefit of that who is suffering, and does not necessarily have any educational value for the one causing the suffering. There are problems with any intervention that is delivered in anticipation of a future negative behaviour. I believe that interventions intended to promote prosocial behaviours (rather than prevent antisocial behaviours) can be hugely valuable	3

	Extremely so. Animals are sentient beings who deserve kind treatment. This is for the animals' sake, of course, but also for the sake of children (and adults/parents) to learn how to be kind to others, to pay attention to others' reactions, and to thereby develop their empathy better (to see things from the other's perspective and then to act accordingly to respect it). So, this has multiple advantages - for the animals, of course, but also for the humans who can develop more satisfying relationships with their animals and prevent dangerous situations from occurring to either the animals or the family members. It also has advantage in the general public, as there are just so many who simply do not see when they are intruding or being unkind	8
	Extremely important because it helps communities to discover not only where animals are suffering but also where families and children are suffering. Helping animals helps communities identify problems and may prevent other forms of violence and abuse	17
Advantages for humans & morality	Our charity's mission statement is to 'connect people with nature', with the goal of getting the public to care about the future of animals as individuals and as species. Appreciation of animal welfare is an important aspect of this mission	26
	While this depends on the type of cruelty, I think intervention is key - whether it's part of active learning as part of early years development to understand a simple moral position around how we treat animals, or a more complex moral or ethical intervention later on	15
	Helps children to understand right from wrong and to intervene when they see cruelty by someone else	27

12

13

14 **Table 5: The main changes practitioners would like to see in children/young people as a result of participating in an**
 15 **intervention (example responses from Round 1)**

Theme	Quotation	Anonymised ID
Improved knowledge/ of animal welfare needs/issues	Learners can give examples of how to care for specific animals and explain. Children provide their pets with the five welfare needs	20
	A greater awareness and understanding of an animal's needs, and recognition of when they may be suffering and how to prevent suffering	6
	The recognition that 'loving animals' isn't enough to be able to give them a positive life. You need to know more about what they need and how they behave	2
Greater recognition of animal sentience	An understanding that animals are sentient and feel pain	4
	Understanding that animals have feelings just as we do	14
	An appreciation of animals as sentient beings	13
Improved skills to identify animal signals/poor welfare	I would like to see children able to identify poor welfare and cruelty	17
	Recognise when an animal is suffering and react accordingly	23
	To understand how to help an animal when it is not happy. How can they change their behaviour to help the animal?	10
Improved empathy/compassion towards animals	Being more empathic towards animals	22
	Increased motivation for compassionate behaviour and to learn more	3
	Children treat their own pets and other animals they encounter with compassion and empathy	20
Improved empathy towards others	Become kinder and more considerate to their classmates, through interactive lessons and role play help to bring senses and emotions in focus	9
	Improved pro social skills, reduction in aggressive or violent behaviour	12
	Increase in empathy towards others (i.e. in the school, reduction in bullying etc)	15
Greater recognition of responsibility & own <small>innate</small>	Children should be able to identify where they can go for help and know that the help will not fail them and there will be protection for them	17
	Increased power to exhibit compassionate behaviour	3

	The recognition that animal welfare is everyone's responsibility, including themselves, and that they do have the power to make better choices for animals	2
More respectful attitudes	A respect for all living things even if they are not perceived as positive in human terms	1
	Children will understand that humans, animals and the environment are all interlinked, all with specific needs relating to care and respect for all	9
	Change in attitudes as children see animals as "people" and not objects	18
Sustained behavioural change/action	Actual behaviour change that is sustained	5
	Adoption of a sustainable lifestyle that reduces the impact on global biodiversity	26
	The knowledge that they can themselves challenge the behaviour of others, to encourage them to make more positive choices for animals	2

17 **Table 6: Gaps in provision identified by participants (example responses from Round 1) (Relevant to long-term goals,**
 18 **current state of AWE and challenges for the future)**

Theme	Quotation	Anonymised ID
Animal welfare/cruelty prevention not recognised as important	It is not "in your face enough". There needs to be adverts, posters and education talks everywhere and available to everyone in every school and every community centre	24
	Pets need to be regarded more realistically and respectfully. Wildlife needs to be protected from inhumane capture and killing. Emphasizing correct and humane killing on farms and when hunting should be done for older children. Emphasizing that animals do feel pain and just because they are not vocalizing out loud does not mean that they do not need veterinary care	17
	I think there is a lack of consistency regarding who is receiving education (only students with teachers keen on animal welfare), which stems from lack of animal welfare education in the curriculum, lack of program or intervention assessment to determine if program is meeting goals it has identified, lack of understanding about animal cruelty and the importance of interventions	16
Should be embedded within national curricula	It should be part of the national curricula of a nation to demonstrate it is considered valuable and important by all of society	1
	I believe animal welfare education should be covered as part of the wider curriculum, so that children in schools who don't receive workshops or intervention (for whatever reason) are given the opportunity to learn	28
	We also know that despite the significant work of animal welfare charities, we simply aren't reaching every child, even within the primary sector, when ideally, animal welfare education should run as a thread throughout a child's years at school	15
Teenagers/secondary school age	Personally, I think that there should be more work with teenagers, but it is hard to target these groups with constraints of GDPR and with the lack of time teachers have. I also think focussing on impact rather than just numbers reached should be most effective	4
	It would be great to do more targeted work with older children/younger adults. PARENTS! I really feel that this is a huge gap. Whilst all the good work may be happening with the child who has been referred to the programme, the parent, who is ultimately responsible may still not understand what is required to keep an animal happy and healthy. In several incidences the parent has allowed the suffering to happen, although this is not always the case	21
	Work experience and apprenticeships for young people to trigger their interest and understanding of animal care	29
At risk/ vulnerable groups	We need to target the vulnerable groups as previously stated. There is a great unmet need for this within YOIs and prisons. It is also clear to me that this should be a core topic for children of all ages	12
	Dog fighting rings who are deliberately cruel - how can we tackle the young people who are at risk of being influenced	27
	We know that there are gaps such as prison inmates	26
Lack of skills based education	Understanding animal communication in a meaningful way and understanding things like hugging a dog can be unpleasant and sometimes frightening for the dog. Particularly in young children statistic shows they are most at risk of being bitten ... therefore this type of accidental 'cruelty' can lead to dog bites. Understanding animal communication and what is mutually enjoyable to the animal is imperative for the animal's welfare and child's safety.	10

	There is a lack of proper consideration for the importance of affective learning. Animal welfare is too often perceived as a science subject	3
	Lack of hands-on education and skills for interacting with animals. Too much "teaching" or "preaching" and not enough playfulness or use of expressive intervention and education approaches. Lack of appropriate involvement of live animals at the right time in the process. It's just not geared for transfer of skills, at least what I have seen	8

19

20

21 **Table 7: Participants definitions of cruelty & reflections (example responses from Round 1)**

Theme	Quotation	Anonymised ID
Unnecessary harm/ suffering, intentional or unintentional	Cruelty to animals is intentionally, or unintentionally, causing suffering to an animal	20
	Cruelty to animals can take many forms from deliberately inflicted pain, suffering and torture to neglect and failure to meet their basic needs and the Five Freedoms. People may inadvertently be cruel to animals by 'killing them with kindness' i.e. feeding them too much to the detriment of their health. They may also leave them alone and unattended for long periods of time and not seek veterinary treatment when required. Cruelty can also involve not allowing an animal to express it's natural behaviour e.g. captive animals, animals exploited for entertainment and not allowed to exhibit natural behaviours	6
	Causing an animal to suffer pain and distress, mental or physical through acts that are intentional or unintentional	19
Deliberate/ intentional harm	An act, or a failure to act, that knowingly results in an animal experiencing 'unjustifiable suffering'?	2
	To me, cruelty is intentional harm of another sentient creature, with no regard for their wellbeing, either by direct, or indirect action	15
	Causing pain, suffering, distress or lasting harm through deliberate direct actions or deliberately failing to take action	11
Cruelty is different to neglect	Cruelty can occur because of ignorance and/or malice. Neglect can occur because of ignorance, lack of resources. Neglect can be less aggressive than cruelty and is not necessarily malicious. Intentional harm, neglect or mistreatment of an animal	28
	Cruelty is separate from neglect. Cruelty is the threat or action of causing physical and mental harm and abuse. Cruelty is causing intentional suffering through withholding of food, water, shelter and social interaction	17
	I would align my definition with that of Frank Ascione's (1993): A socially unacceptable behaviour that intentionally causes unnecessary pain or suffering to an animal. I recognize that other common definitions of cruelty include both intentional and unintentional actions. Although unintentional actions (neglect) may cause suffering, I believe that neglect is different from cruelty even though both scenarios can cause suffering to an animal	16
Defining cruelty is difficult/undesirable	The term 'cruelty' is used in many different ways and is interpreted and defined differently by different individuals, depending upon their background and upbringing, experience, culture, religious beliefs (if any), education and whether they align themselves with any particular moral philosophy... the term 'unnecessary suffering' will be open to interpretation. It will depend on the context of the incident and the species (& possibly breed) of the animal. To some, there would be many interpretations of 'unnecessary suffering'. Take the example of chicken farming - some would argue that the 'battery' system causes unnecessary suffering, but would be OK with other intensive rearing practices. Others may consider ALL chicken farming to cause 'unnecessary suffering' as humans can obtain their dietary protein without using animals at all. It's hugely frustrating to pinpoint the issue to a distinct 'black or white' answer	2
	Any negative impact on the wellbeing of animals caused by a human behaviour. However this is an extremely nuanced subject in which the term could be applied to differing contexts and result in differing meanings	5
	I have an immediate problem with this question. [Our] education programmes are founded on the principles of humane pedagogy which seeks to promote prosocial behaviours, not prevent cruelty. Approaching this	3

	subject from a 'prevent cruelty' perspective has an inherent judgement at its heart which is against the basic principles of humane pedagogy. It potentially has a wide variety of negative consequences	
--	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--