A review of the humaneness of puntilla as a slaughter method

G Limon*, J Guitian and NG Gregory

Royal Veterinary College, Hawkshead Lane, Hatfield AL9 7TA, UK
* Contact for correspondence and requests for reprints: glimon@rvc.ac.uk

Abstract

Puntilla is a traditional slaughter method in which a knife is plunged into the back of the neck to sever the spinal cord. The aim is to produce immediate collapse of the animal. Puntilla is not condoned as a stunning method by the World Animal Health Organisation (OIE) because there is concern that the animal could be conscious during and after the neck stab. Nonetheless, it is still used in some developing countries. The effectiveness and humaneness of puntilla followed by neck sticking was examined at two slaughterhouses in Bolivia. Twenty llamas (Lama glama) and 309 cattle were observed during routine puntilla without stunning. The number of neck stabs was recorded, and then brain and spinal functions (rhythmic breathing, palpebral reflex and eyeball rotation) were assessed. In addition, the presence of specific cognitive responses (such as responses to a threat stimulus and noise, as well as to flavours and odours), were also assessed in cattle. Breed, sex, live weight, body condition score and the slaughterman’s experience were recorded. Repeat stabbing was needed to penetrate the foramen ovale in 45% of the llamas and two of them attempted to stand following collapse after the initial stab. All llamas showed rhythmic breathing movements at the flank following puntilla and before sticking, and 95% had a positive palpebral reflex at the same time. Twenty-four percent of the cattle needed repeat stabbing. Repeat stabbing was significantly less frequent with experienced slaughtermen, and more frequent in heavyweight animals (> 380 kg). Brain and spinal responses were present in 91% of the cattle following the stabs. When cattle attempted to stand after a neck stab they were more likely to have rhythmic breathing, positive palpebral response and responsiveness to threat, noise and brief air stimulus applied to the face. These findings indicate that it is difficult in practice to penetrate the spinal cord with a single puntilla stab. Some nerve pathways are often functional after the neck stab and therefore it is highly likely that the animals remain conscious in at least some modalities for the next part of the slaughter procedure. The challenge in developing countries, however, is to find a strategy that encourages use of a method which limits suffering whilst being accessible for routine slaughter practice.

Keywords: animal welfare, Bolivia, cattle and llamas, degree of awareness, puntilla, slaughter

Introduction

Puntilla (also known as neck stabbing and evernazione) is a traditional slaughter method in which a knife is plunged into the back of the neck of the animal to sever the spinal cord (Dembo 1894). The animal immediately collapses, and can then be stuck and processed in the normal way. In the past this method has been advocated by animal protection groups as a humane alternative to contemporary methods (Gregory 1989), but now it is not condoned as a stunning method by the World Organisation for Animal Health (OIE) (World Organisation for Animal Health 2006), and is forbidden in European Union slaughterhouses because it is considered inhumane. The method is, however, still used in many developing countries (Cartes-Sanchez 2000; Pham Hong Nhat 2006; Osborne 2009) where no alternative methods are available other than sticking the animal without stunning.

In the human, 4 out of 17 patients with transcranial stab wounds that involved either the midbrain or brainstem survived the insult even though there was persistent hemiplegia in each of the four subjects (Nathoo et al 2000). This study showed that incomplete transection of the lower brain does not invariably induce irreversible unconsciousness. It has also been shown in mice (Mus musculus) that sensory responses are dependent on the severity of the lesion in the spinal cord. In addition, pain from stimuli, which is not normally painful (ie allodynic behaviour), can be induced when some ascending fibres are left intact (Hoschouer et al 2010).

Puntilla is different from pithing. For example, in fish, pithing is a common procedure in some parts of the world and usually involves maceration of the lower brain without direct transection of the spinal cord. It is not clear whether pithing is a humane procedure but it is recognised that it requires skill on the part of the operator (Noga 2000).

It has been recognised by the Food and Agriculture Organisation of the United Nations (FAO) that animal welfare is highly relevant to success in international development. Within a range of topics that need to be addressed, slaughter and pre-slaughter are some of the areas that